

BS"D

Rosh Yeshiva's Weekly Gemorra Shiur

Sukka Daf 2a

Kushias

I What is the Kasha of the Mai Sh'na

- A. Four possibilities
 1. The tanna must be consistent in language in all places
 2. The tanna should use the same language here as he chose to use there
 3. The tanna should use the same language there as he chose to use here
 4. The tanna should use the language that I deem to be the more correct in place of the less correct term wherever it may be.

II Kasha #1 on Rashi

- A. Rashi in "tanni takanta" explains that even though it would have been preferred, we were not able to teach the word p'sul for the mabui, and for sukka where the tanna was able to use the word p'sul, he preferred to do so. This implies that the kasha of mai sh'na was like #4 of the four possibilities and was raising the kasha that the mishna in Eruvin should have used the more correct term of p'sul.
- B. The Rashi in "Eibayis Aima" explains that it was preferred to use the word takanta for sukka but that we were unable to for technical reasons. This implies that the kasha of mai sh'na was a #4 kasha on our mishna here in Sukka.
- C. Since we know the two terutzim must be coming to answer the same kasha it is difficult to justify Rashi's two explanations which imply they were responding to two different kashas.

III Kasha #2 on Rashi

- A. Rashi in "tanni p'sul" explains that since p'sul is the appropriate and preferred word to use for sukka the tanna chose to use it. This implies that **the word "takanta" was also appropriate** but the tanna chose the more preferred word. A proof for this implication is that Rashi did not say there was any problem with using the word takanta for sukka.
- B. The Gemorra's 2nd teretz poses a difficulty to Rashi since it says "we can also say that for Torah law we can **נני** use the word takanta..." This implies that the original teretz held we **could not use the word takanta** and the 2nd teretz is responding to that by saying no, we can also **נני**—use the word takanta. This contradicts what Rashi said above that the original teretz held that "takanta" was also a valid word to use for sukka.